

0209

Efficacy of Ozone Fumigation to Control Some Stored Product Insects

Lidia Limonta^{*}, Massimiliano Stampini and Daria Patrizia Locatelli

Abstract: Ozone is a toxic gas with potential to replace methyl bromide for controlling stored product pests. The efficacy of an ozone fumigation treatment on beetles (*Sitophilus oryzae*, *Rhyzopertha dominica*, and *Tribolium confusum*), and moths (*Cadra cautella*, *Corcyra cephalonica*, *Ephestia kuehniella*, and *Plodia interpunctella*) was evaluated. Insects at various stages of development (eggs, larvae, pupae, and adults of *S. oryzae* and *R. dominica*; eggs, third instar larvae and adults of *T. confusum*; eggs, and third instar larvae of moths) were treated with ozone at 600 ppm v/v, 20 ± 2°C, for different time periods (from 30 min to 3 hours). Treatments were carried out in a column (10 cm dia. × 110 cm) containing 4 kg of rough rice (paddy). Mortality was assessed at 24 and 48 hours after treatment, and weekly thereafter.

The egg stage was the most tolerant to ozone fumigation treatment for all the species tested. Ozone fumigation for 30 min killed 100% of the third instar larvae of the four species of moths and of *S. oryzae* adults. More than 50% of the adults of *R. dominica* and of *T. confusum* and 30% of third instar larvae of *T. confusum* were alive 24 hours after a 30 minute treatment; but they were found dead after 48 hours. After a 1 hour treatment, some third instar larvae and adults of *T. confusum* were alive after 24 hours; but they were found dead after 48 hours. To obtain a 100% mortality of all the stages of the species tested, a 3 hour ozone fumigation treatment was required.

Key words: *Sitophilus oryzae*, *Rhyzopertha dominica*, *Tribolium confusum*, *Cadra cautella*, *Corcyra cephalonica*, *Ephestia kuehniella*, *Plodia interpunctella*, fumigation, ozone

Introduction

Ozone is a highly oxidising agent and widely used in food industry for disinfection of surfaces, for hygiene in processing plants and to treat some foods for controlling insects and fungi [1,2,3,4,5,6,7]. Ozone is highly reactive and damages cell membranes of organisms by causing oxidative stress^[8], but does not affect intrinsic grain properties or seed germination^[9].

In 1965, Beard^[10] indicated that prolonged exposure to high levels of ozone was lethal to adult house flies and caused flies to lay fewer eggs per female. Levy et al.^[11] observed that eggs and larvae of *Musca domestica* (L.) and *Stomoxys calcitrans* (L.) are less susceptible to ozone compared to pupae and adults.

Both laboratory tests^[9,12,13] and field trials have been carried out to verify the efficacy of ozone fumigation on stored product insects with different concentrations and different exposure times. Kells et al.^[14], treating 8.9 tonnes of maize with 50 ppm ozone for 3 days, obtained 92% – 100% mortality of some insects of stored products. Field experiments on strains of *Rhyzopertha dominica* (F.) with a high level re-

sistance to phosphine showed susceptibility to ozone fumigation^[15].

Although low pressures and CO₂ may improve efficacy of some fumigants, requiring shorter fumigation periods, the efficacy of high concentration ozone on *Ephestia kuehniella* (Zell.) is not enhanced under low pressure of 100 mmHg and 92% CO₂^[16].

The efficacy of an ozone fumigation treatment on beetles and moths was evaluated at high concentrations of ozone with short exposures.

Materials and Methods

Tests were performed on *Cadra cautella* (Walk.), *Corcyra cephalonica* (Staint.), *Ephestia kuehniella* (Zell.), *Plodia interpunctella* (Hbn.), *Sitophilus oryzae* (L.), *Rhyzopertha dominica* (F.) and *Tribolium confusum* J. du Val. The procedure adopted was a) to place insects at different stages of development with paddy rice (rough rice) inside a column, and b) to treat with ozone and observe their survival.

Tests were carried out by SAPIO produzione idrogeno ossigeno srl., Via Malcontenta 49, Porto Marghera (VE) Italy.

Istituto di Entomologia agraria, Università degli Studi di Milano, Via Celoria 220133, Milano, Italy.

^{*} Corresponding author; lidia.limonta@unimi.it

Test insects were reared in thermostatically controlled incubators at $26 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$; $70 \pm 5\%$ r. h. at the Istituto di Entomologia agraria, Università degli Studi, Milan, Italy.

The moth species were reared on a diet used for mass rearing^[17].

For the moth species, the eggs were collected from Petri dishes placed under a special plexiglass egg-laying cylinder, 15 cm dia. x 40 cm, with the base fitted with an 18 mesh metal net through which the eggs fall. Eggs were collected from 50 moths in each cylinder. Tests were carried out on eggs laid 30 – 48 hours previously, and held at the laying conditions.

T. confusum was reared on soft wheat flour, maize flour and bran (in equal parts). To obtain eggs and larvae of *T. confusum* were obtained by sieving (60 mesh) a 50 g sample of sieved soft wheat flour, previously infested for a period of 5 days by 100 adults.

Eggs of *S. oryzae* and *R. dominica* were obtained by exposing rice samples (50 g) to 100 adults for 5 days. Larvae were obtained from 50 g samples of cereals containing eggs laid 8 – 11 days, 13 – 16 days and 18 – 23 days before the treatment. For pupae, the period prior to exposure was 26 – 30 days.

The fumigation system was made of an ozone generator connected to a polycarbonate cylinder (10 cm dia., 110 cm high). The generator produced ozone from purified oxygen (0.8 L/min). In the cylinder, ozone concentration was 600 ppm v/v. Ozone was introduced from the bottom of the cylinder through a perforated plate. The top of the cylinder had a lid with holes used to regulate the ozone exit. The exit gas stream was heated to 80°C to decompose the ozone present to oxygen.

Insects were added to 4 kg of paddy rice in the column; groups of 20 larvae for each moth species and for *T. confusum*, while for the other beetles, 20 g of infested material for each tested stages or instars were added. Groups of a 100 eggs for each moth species and for *T. confusum*, were placed in gauze bags (70 mesh). In tests with adult beetles, groups of 20 individuals of *T. confusum* and 50 of *R. dominica* and of *S. oryzae* were introduced in the column at $20 \pm 2^\circ\text{C}$ for different time periods (from 30 min to 3 hours). Each test was repeated 4 times, each with an untreated control batch.

The mortality adults of all the species and the third instar larvae of the moths and of *T. confusum* were assessed after 24 and 48 hours. In the other cases, the biological samples were

maintained at a temperature of $26 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$ and $70 \pm 5\%$ r. h. and checked weekly until adult emergence. Mortality was corrected according to Abbott's formula^[18].

Results

One hundred percent mortality of all the tested stages of moths and beetles was obtained with a 3 hours ozone fumigation.

Eggs of moths were the most tolerant stage to ozone fumigation. With 30 minutes fumigation, a corrected mortality of $< 50\%$ for eggs of *Cadra cautella*, *Corcyra cephalonica*, and *Ephestia kuehniella* was obtained (Table 1). *Plodia interpunctella* (79.7% corrected mortality) was the least tolerant species.

Table 1. Effect of ozone fumigation at 600 ppm on eggs of *Cadra cautella*, *Corcyra cephalonica*, *Ephestia kuehniella* and *Plodia interpunctella* for different exposure times, expressed as percentage mortality (percentage values corrected according to Abbott's formula).

| Species | Corrected mortality % | | | |
|------------------------------|-----------------------|------|------|-----|
| | 30 min | 1 h | 2 h | 3 h |
| <i>Cadra cautella</i> | 49.1 | 85.6 | 91.6 | 100 |
| <i>Corcyra cephalonica</i> | 31.6 | 67.5 | 80.6 | 100 |
| <i>Ephestia kuehniella</i> | 34.7 | 69.9 | 98.7 | 100 |
| <i>Plodia interpunctella</i> | 79.7 | 88.7 | 92.1 | 100 |

After a 1 hour fumigation, mortality of moth eggs was between 67.5 (*C. cephalonica*) and 88.7% (*P. interpunctella*). After 2 hours fumigation, mortality was $> 90\%$, except for *C. cephalonica* (80.6%). Third instar larvae of moths were most susceptible to ozone fumigation; a 30 minutes fumigation was enough to obtain a 100% corrected mortality.

As far as the beetles were concerned, with a 2 hours fumigation, eggs of *T. confusum* were the least susceptible stage (Table 2). Mortality of eggs of *R. dominica* after 30 minutes and 1 hour were 87.7 and 97.5% mortality. For eggs of *S. oryzae* these values were 41.7 and 72.5%, respectively. With a 2 hours treatment, a mortality higher than 95% was obtained for eggs of both *R. dominica* and *S. oryzae*.

32.5% of third instar larvae and 63% of adults of *T. confusum*, and 64.5% of adults of *R. dominica* survived for > 24 hours after an ozone fumigation of 30 minutes (Table 3), but all

were dead (100% mortality) after 48 hours. All adults of *S. oryzae* were dead after 24 hours succeeding the fumigation treatment. Larvae and pupae of *R. dominica* and of *S. oryzae* were susceptible to a 30 minutes fumigation. After 24 hours following a 1 hour fumigation, 2.5% of third instar larvae and 1% of adults of *T. confusum* were still alive, but all were dead after 48 hours.

Table 2. Effect of ozone fumigation at 600 ppm on eggs of *Sitophilus oryzae*, *Rhyzopertha dominica* and *Tribolium confusum* for different exposure times, expressed as percentage mortality (percentage values corrected according to Abbott's formula).

| Species | Corrected mortality % | | | |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------|------|------|-----|
| | 30 min | 1 h | 2 h | 3 h |
| <i>Rhyzopertha dominica</i> | 87.7 | 97.5 | 100 | 100 |
| <i>Sitophilus oryzae</i> | 76.0 | 77.4 | 97.2 | 100 |
| <i>Tribolium confusum</i> | 41.7 | 72.5 | 92.1 | 100 |

Table 3. Percentage of adults of *Rhyzopertha dominica* and larvae and adults of *Tribolium confusum* surviving a 30 min exposure at 600 ppm ozone at 24 hours and 48 hours after the fumigation.

| Species | Survival % | |
|---|------------|-----|
| | 24h | 48h |
| <i>Rhyzopertha dominica</i> adults | 64.5 | 0 |
| <i>Tribolium confusum</i> III instar larvae | 32.5 | 0 |
| <i>Tribolium confusum</i> adults | 63.0 | 0 |

Adult insects, derived from eggs surviving the ozone fumigation, displayed the postembryonal development period observed to those untreated (controls).

Discussion

With 600 ppm ozone concentration, the egg was the most tolerant stage. To obtain a 100% mortality, 2 hours fumigation were required for *Rhyzopertha dominica* and 3 hours for *Sitophilus oryzae*, *Tribolium confusum*, *Cadra cautella*, *Corcyra cephalonica*, *Ephestia kuehniella* and *Plodia interpunctella*.

Ozone, unlike nitrogen and carbon dioxide, was lethal at short periods of fumigation to stages of insects that develop inside the kernels, such as *Rhyzopertha dominica* and *Sitophilus oryzae*. In this research, with a high concentration of ozone, a complete mortality was ob-

served after a 30 minutes fumigation.

Erdman^[19] fumigated insects at 300 ppm ozone and observed a complete mortality of adults of *T. castaneum* and *T. confusum* during few days after the treatment. Also in this research, with the 30 minutes fumigation, third instar larvae and adults of *T. confusum* and adults of *R. dominica* were alive after 24 hours and dead after 48 hours.

With high concentration of ozone the fumigation period is reduced. With low concentrations it was observed, in a laboratory study, that 5 ppm of ozone resulted in a 100% mortality of adult *Oryzaephilus surinamensis* (L.) and *T. confusum* after exposure times of 3 and 5 days respectively^[20]. Laboratory studies have indicated that 50 ppm ozone for 3 days killed adult insects commonly found in stored grain^[1]. Kells et al.^[14] fumigated insects at 25 ppm and 50 ppm ozone for 3 days and observed that adults of *S. oryzae* are more susceptible than adults of *T. confusum*. In our tests, we observed the same response. Besides, Erdman^[19] showed that *T. castaneum* was consistently more ozone-sensitive than *T. confusum*.

Ozone fumigation does not leave toxic residues and requires, at high concentrations, a short period of treatment. It is an interesting alternative to the use of fumigants and of physical methods that require a long period of application, such as nitrogen and carbon dioxide. An attractive aspect of ozone is that it decomposes rapidly (half life in air of 20 – 50 min) to molecular oxygen without residues, and ozone can be generated on-site, eliminating the need to store or dispose of chemical containers. A high content of dust in cereals can negatively affect the efficacy of CO₂ treatment^[21,22] and the same result was observed also for ozone fumigation^[23]. A disadvantage of ozone application is its corrosive properties towards most metals^[9,12]. Nevertheless, the use of ozone fumigation is interesting in the disinfection of stored products such as cereals stocked in concrete silos and in steel silos after coating with specific resins. It is noteworthy that inox steel (AISI 316) silos is not susceptible to ozone corrosion.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Dr A. Bacci and G. Carra of SAPIO produzione idrogeno ossigeno srl., Via Malcontenta 49, Porto Marghera (VE) Italy for having placed the necessary equipment at our disposal, and also for providing us with

regular technical assistance during the tests.

References

- [1] Strait C A. Efficacy of ozone to control insects and fungi in stored grain. M S thesis, Purdue University, West Lafayette, IN, 1998
- [2] Rice R G. , Farquhar J W, Bollyky L J. Review of the application of ozone for increasing storage times of perishable foods. *Ozone Science and Engineering*, 1982, 4; 147 – 163.
- [3] Graham D M. Use of ozone for food processing. *Food Technology*, 1997, 51; 72 – 75
- [4] Kim J G. , Yousef A E, Dave S. Application of ozone for enhancing the microbiological safety and quality of foods; a review. *Journal of Food Protection*, 1999, 62; 1071 – 1087
- [5] Leesch J, Armstrong J, Tebbets J et al. Insect control with ozone gas as an alternative to methyl bromide. Proceedings of International research Conference on Methyl Bromide Alternatives. Orlando, Florida, November 3 – 6, 2004, pp. 631 – 632
- [6] Leesch J, Tebbets J, Tebbets J. Using ozone for controlling bean thrips in the navels of oranges being exported to Australia. Proceedings of the International Conference Controlled Atmosphere & Fumigation in Stored Products International. August 8 – 13, 2004, Gold Coast, Australia, 2007, 167 – 177
- [7] Navarro S. New global challenges to the use of gaseous treatments in stored products. Proceedings of the 9th International Working Conference on Stored Product Protection, Campinas, Sao Paulo, Brasil, 15 – 18 October 2006, 495 – 509
- [8] Hollingsworth R G, Armstrong J W. Potential of temperature, Controlled atmospheres, and ozone fumigation to control thrips and mealybugs on ornamental plants for export. *Journal of Economic Entomology*, 2005, 98; 289 – 298
- [9] Mason LJ, Strait CA, Woloshuk CP et al. Controlling stored grain insects with ozone fumigation. In: Zuxun J, Quan L, Yongshen L et al. eds. , Proceedings of the 7th international Working Conference on Stored Product Protection, Beijing, China, 14 – 19 October 1998. Sichuan Publishing House of Science and Technology, Chengdu, pp. 536 – 547
- [10] Beard RL. Observations on house flies in high – ozone environments. *Annals of the Entomological Society of America*, 1965, 58(3); 404 – 405
- [11] Levy R, Chiu Y J, Cromroy H L. Effects of ozone on three species of diptera. *Environmental Entomology*, 1972, 1; 608 – 611
- [12] Leesch J. The mortality of stored – product insects following exposure to gaseous ozone at high concentrations. Proceedings of the 8th International Working Conference on Stored Product Protection, 22 – 26 July, York, UK, 2002, pp. 827 – 831
- [13] Isikber A A, ztekin S, Ulusoy R et al. Effectiveness of gaseous ozone alone and in combination with low pressure or carbon dioxide against *Ephestia kuehniella* (Zell.) (Lepidoptera: Pyralidae) at short exposure time. *Integrated Protection of Stored Products IOBC/wprs Bulletin*, 2007, 30; 205 – 213
- [14] Kells S A, Mason L J, Maier D E et al. Efficacy and fumigation characteristics of ozone in stored maize. *Journal of Stored Product Research*, 2001, 37; 371 – 382
- [15] Qin Zhanguai, Wu Xia, Deng Gang et al. Investigation of the use of ozone fumigation to control several species of stored grain insects. Proceedings of the 8th International Working Conference on Stored Product Protection, York, UK, 2002, pp. 846 – 851
- [16] Isikber A A, ztekin S. Comparison of susceptibility of stored product insects, *Ephestia kuehniella* (Zell.) and *Tribolium confusum* Du Val. to ozone gaseous. IOBC/WPRS Conference, August 20 – 23, 2007, Poznan, Poland. In press
- [17] Locatelli D P, Limonta L. Ability of *Plodia interpunctella* (Hbn.) (Lepidoptera: Pyralidae) larvae in finding food and flavours. *Bollettino di Zoologia Agraria e Bachicoltura*, 2004, ser. II, 36(1); 149 – 154
- [18] Abbott W S. A method for computing the effectiveness of an insecticide. *Journal of Economical Entomology*, 1925, 18; 265 – 267
- [19] Erdman H E. Ozone toxicity during ontogeny of two species of flour beetles, *Tribolium confusum* and *T. castaneum*. *Environmental Entomology*, 1980, 9; 16 – 17
- [20] Mason L J, Woloshuk C P, Maier D E. Efficacy of ozone to control insects, molds and mycotoxins. In: Donahaye E J, Navarro S, Varnava A eds. , Proceedings of the International Conference on Controlled Atmosphere and Fumigation in Stored Products. Nicosia, Cyprus printer Ltd. , Nicosia, 1997, pp. 665 – 670
- [21] S ss L, Locatelli D P, Cigognetti I. Valutazione dell' uso di atmosfere modificate con CO₂ nella disinfestazione dei cereali. Atti del Convegno " La conservazione dei cereali: reatted esperienze a confronto" , Bologna, 1988, pp. 199 – 209
- [22] Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, Agricultural Science Service. Control of storage pests using modified atmosphere. Research and development report. Storage pests 1983. Book 251 (83) . London: Her Majesty's Stationery Office
- [23] Hansen P. Application of ozone as a fumigant to prevent unwanted biologic activity in stored grain. IOBC/WPRS Conference, August 20 – 23, 2007, Poznan, Poland. In press